

## **Appendix A: Public Participation**

The participatory process included two components: working group workshops and opinion surveys.

Four workshops were hosted by Manhattan Community Board 10 in order to solicit feedback from the working group during the various stages of the Adam Clayton Powell, Jr. State Office Building Plaza’s planning and design process. Participating organizations included Manhattan Community Board 10, New York State Office of General Services – Adam Clayton Powell, Jr. State Office Building, Harlem Community Development Corporation, Apollo Theater, Christmas Tree in Harlem Committee, City Scape/Central Park Conservancy, Harlem Arts Alliance, Harlem Business Alliance, Harlem Renaissance Economic Development Corporation, Mama Foundation for the Arts, and the Studio Museum of Harlem.

The survey was conducted in two parts. Employees from tenant agencies in the State Office Building were contacted, resulting in responses from 21 of the 29 agencies in the building. A survey of general users was conducted by randomly approaching Plaza users, yielding 23 responses.

### **Workshops**

The first workshop was held on August 10, 2006. UTAP presented an analysis of existing conditions, including maps of the Context Area, site plan, streetscape elevations, 3D models, shadow analysis, pedestrian movement patterns, and formal activities in the Plaza. Participants expressed desires to make the Plaza more comfortable, especially in terms of wind, shade, seating, and lighting. Suggestions were made to create a feeling of openness, with site-lines guiding walkers in clear paths across the Plaza. There was discussion of developing a digital information kiosk.

The second workshop was held on September 20, 2006. The presentation topic was the preliminary design strategy. Capitalizing on the Plaza’s historic significance as “African Square,” UTAP elaborated a design concept based on elements of public spaces in West African villages. Participants responded positively to the idea. One member commended the use of curved lines, while

another expressed that adding a water element would create a “total natural environment.” Other issues discussed included security issues, shade, wind protection, and opportunities presented by the under-utilized of the east side of the Plaza.

The third workshop, held on October 4, delved further into issues of the Plaza design concept. UTAP presented more detailed images of the proposed design improvements, including the lighting, seating and greenery. Participants extensively discussed the need for the Plaza to become an artistic/cultural hub of Upper Manhattan. One member emphasized the role of digital technology to create constantly changing exhibitions representing all the cultures of Harlem. In addition, issues of improved lighting and the definition of clear spaces in the Plaza were discussed.

The fourth workshop was held on October 26. UTAP presented the final design to the working group and solicited comments.

### **Survey of Tenant Agencies of the State Office Building**

This survey yielded 21 responses. The respondents were familiar with the area of Central Harlem, having worked there for an average of 11.6 years and visited for an average of 24.7 years. 42.9% also lived in the area, for an average of 15.6 years.

<b>Total Respondents</b>	<b>(21)</b>
<b>What is your zip code?</b> <i>(How many live in Upper Manhattan?)</i>	<b>(21)</b> 42.9%
<b>For how many years have you:</b>	<b>(21)</b>
lived in this area? <i>(average)</i>	15.6
visited this area? <i>(average)</i>	24.7
worked in this area? <i>(average)</i>	11.6

Each office has an average of 19 employees and 34 daily visitors. With a total of 29 offices, it can be estimated that approximately 1,500 people pass through the Plaza on their way to the State Office Building each day.

<b>State Office Building Agency Information:</b>	<b>(21)</b>
How many people work in your office? ( <i>average</i> )	19
On average, how many visitors come to your office everyday?	34

Most of the respondents regularly spend time in the Plaza – 85.7% visit once per week or more.

<b>How often do you visit the Plaza?</b>	<b>(21)</b>
regularly (more than once a week)	71.4%
frequently (once a week on average)	14.3%
occasionally (twice a month or less)	14.3%

While every State Office Building employee passes through on their way to work, a majority of the respondents surveyed also visit the Plaza to attend activities (61.9%), and some visit for outdoor relaxation (23.8%).

<b>Which of the following reasons brings you to the Plaza?</b>	<b>(21)</b>
passing through to the State Office Building	100%
activities at the Plaza (ex. Health Fair, Farmers Market, concerts etc.)	61.9%
outdoor relaxation	23.8%

Respondents use various transportation modes to reach the Plaza. The subway was chosen most often (52.4%), although driving (38.1%), walking (33.3%) and riding the bus (28.6%) were also common. Respondents chose all applicable options.

<b>What mode of transportation do you use to and from the Plaza?</b>	<b>(21)</b>
walk	33.3%
bus	28.6%
subway	52.4%
drive	38.1%
taxi	9.5%

To the abstract question of quality, more respondents rated the Plaza as “good” or “very good” (45%) than “Poor” or “Very Bad” (30%). However, when it came to particulars, it turned out that most respondents wanted to see changes. Clear majorities would like to see changes to the landscaping (77.8%), seating (83.3%), and lighting (77.8%). In addition, 55.6% would like to see changes to the physical layout and activities.

<b>How would you rate the quality of the Plaza today?</b>	<b>(20)</b>
very good	5.0%
good	40.0%
fair	30.0%
poor	20.0%
very bad	10.0%

<b>What would you like to see changed in the Plaza?</b>	<b>(18)</b>
physical layout	55.6%
landscaping (plants, trees, paving etc.)	77.8%
seating	83.3%
lighting	77.8%
activities	55.6%

Only 11 out of the 21 respondents (52.2%) would like to see some element of the Plaza retained. Out of those, the physical layout and activities were chosen most often, at 54.5% each.

<b>What would you like to see retained in the Plaza?</b>	<b>(11)</b>
physical layout	54.5%
landscaping (plants, trees, paving etc.)	36.4%
seating	18.2%
lighting	18.2%
activities	54.5%

In terms of additions to the Plaza, responses were spread evenly among all of the options: landscaping (66.7%), seating (60%), lighting (66.7%), and activities (60%).

<b>What would you like to see added to the Plaza?</b>	<b>(15)</b>
landscaping (plants, trees, paving etc.)	66.7%
seating	60.0%
lighting	66.7%
activities	60.0%

Respondents were generally receptive to the idea of more artistic and cultural expressions in the Plaza. 78.9% would like to see more music, followed closely by theater/film (73.7%), sculpture (66.4%), and engraved words (63.2%).

<b>What form of artistic/cultural expression would you like to see on the Plaza?</b>	<b>(19)</b>
sculpture	68.4%
words	63.2%
food	57.9%
music	78.9%
dance	52.6%
theater/film	73.7%

Respondents were also given free reign to state their opinions in the “Other” category for each question, with clear patterns emerging. For example, to the question “What would you like to see retained?” five respondents (23.8%) mentioned the statue of Adam Clayton Powell, Jr. In a similar vein, several respondents would like to see more monuments to Harlem or Black history. Others requested an informational kiosk, outdoor artwork, and exhibition space for local museums, making the Plaza the focal point of Harlem. On the other hand, 23.8% of respondents expressed concerns over security and loitering in the Plaza.

### Survey of General Public

The general survey yielded 23 responses. Out of those, 52.2% were residents of Upper Manhattan and had lived in the area for an average of 10.6 years. On the whole, the respondents had been visiting the area for an average of 16.2 years.

<b>Total Respondents</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>What is your zip code?</b> <i>(How many live in Upper Manhattan)</i>	<b>(23)</b> 52.2%
<b>For how many years have you:</b>	<b>(22)</b>
lived in this area? <i>(average)</i>	10.6
visited this area? <i>(average)</i>	16.2

The people approached for the survey had a variety of reasons to visit the Plaza, ranging from passing through to another destination (30.4%), passing through to the State Office Building (26.1%), or just relaxing outdoors (21.7%).

<b>What brings you to the Plaza today?</b>	<b>(23)</b>
passing through to the State Office Building	26.1%
passing through to another destination	30.4%
activities at the Plaza (ex. Health Fair, Farmers Market, concerts etc.)	4.3%
outdoor relaxation	21.7%
waiting for a bus	4.3%
visiting Harlem	4.3%

While the majority came by subway (39.1%) or walking (30.4%), other modes such as bus (17.4%), driving (8.7%) and taxi (4.3%) were represented.

<b>What means of transportation did you use to reach the Plaza?</b>	<b>(23)</b>
walk	30.4%
bus	17.4%
subway	39.1%

drive	8.7%
taxi	4.3%

56.5% of the respondents visit the Plaza more than once per week, while the rest only visit occasionally. Of the regular visitors, the majority pass through on the way to the State Office Building (58.3%), although activities and outdoor relaxation are also draws (41.7% each). The majority of regular visitors arrive by subway (58.3%).

<b>How often did you visit the Plaza?</b>	<b>(23)</b>
regularly (more than once a week)	56.5%
frequently (once a week on average)	0.0%
occasionally (twice a month or less)	43.5%

<b>Which of the following reasons bring you to the Plaza?</b>	<b>(12)</b>
passing through to the State Office Building	58.3%
activities at the Plaza (ex. Health Fair, Farmers Market, concerts etc.)	41.7%
outdoor relaxation	41.7%

<b>What means of transportation do you use to and from the Plaza?</b>	<b>(12)</b>
walk	25.0%
bus	25.0%
subway	58.3%
drive	25.0%

A slight majority of respondents rated the Plaza’s quality as “good” (52.4%) while most of the rest rated it “fair” (38.1%).

<b>How would you rate the quality of the Plaza today?</b>	<b>(21)</b>
very good	9.5%
good	52.4%
fair	38.1%
poor	0.0%
very bad	0.0%

20 out of the 23 (85.7%) respondents would like to see changes in the Plaza. However, while the greatest number picked seating (45%), no specific element was chosen by a majority.

<b>What would you like to see changed in the Plaza?</b>	<b>(20)</b>
physical layout	15.0%
landscaping (plants, trees, paving etc.)	25.0%
seating	45.0%
lighting	25.0%
activities	15.0%

12 out of 23 (52.2%) would like to see elements of the Plaza retained. The specific elements were spread across all choices available with no clear pattern emerging.

<b>What would you like to see retained in the Plaza?</b>	<b>(12)</b>
physical layout	41.7%
landscaping (plants, trees, paving etc.)	50.0%
seating	50.0%
lighting	33.3%
activities	41.7%

22 out of 23 (95.7%) would like to see additions to the Plaza, although again, no specific element stood out above the rest.

<b>What would you like to see added to the Plaza?</b>	<b>(22)</b>
landscaping (plants, trees, paving etc.)	36.4%
seating	31.8%
lighting	27.3%
activities	18.2%
visitor center	36.4%
water feature	40.9%

In terms of artistic and cultural representation, a slight majority (52.9%) of respondents requested more music while sculpture and theater/film also received a significant response (35.3% each).

**What type of artistic or cultural representation would you like to see on the Plaza?**

	(17)
sculpture	35.3%
words	11.8%
food	5.9%
music	52.9%
dance	11.8%
theater/film	35.3%

**Survey Results - Conclusion**

The results of the surveys show that the Plaza’s quality is important to the tenants of the State Office Building as well as the general public using the Plaza. They would like to the Plaza to become a more comfortable, aesthetic, and safe place to spend free time, with a range of activities and artwork that reflect the local history and culture of Harlem.

## **Design Response**

### *Clarify spaces:*

Achieved with the introduction of a wall, definition and continuity to the Plaza.

### *Protection from wind:*

Achieved by enclosing the breezeways, as well as planting a double row of street trees.

### *Protection from sun:*

New trees will be planted in the eastern side of the Plaza to create a comfortable seating area.

### *Lighting:*

Increased lighting will be provided by the breezeways and the expanded lobby. The wall will be illuminated from the bottom along its full length. Additional vertical light fixtures can be inserted where needed. The vertical kiosks will also illuminate the Plaza.

### *Define circulations:*

Entry points to the Plaza are clearly defined by the wall; a black paving element outlines the formal Plaza; a site line across the Plaza to the Studio Museum of Harlem will be defined.

### *Interpretation of African design elements:*

The wall is used as historical marker. Trees define the slightly elevated seating/meeting space. A water element is found near an entrance. The color of the wall (Cor-ten) is reminiscent of laterite stone. Sacred elements (altars to the feminine and the masculine) are found on the Plaza while space for market and fairs is outside the wall.

### *Seating:*

Both fixed and movable seating is provided. The fixed seating is integrated into the wall, or facing the wall. Informal seating can happen on the wall granite base or along planters and water basin. Moveable seats will be used in the eastern, shaded seating area.

*Emergency access:*

Emergency vehicles can enter site at 126<sup>th</sup> Street. Entrance points and paths have been sized to accommodate such vehicles. If bollards are used, they would have to be retractable.

*Water element:*

A fountain is located near the 125<sup>th</sup> street entry point to the plaza, along the wall. Seating along its edge is possible.

*Landscaping:*

Because the Plaza is the roof of a garage, the planting of large shading tree is not feasible. Most greenery will be in planters integrated to the wall. On the eastern side, trees will shade the seating area, with an elevated platform providing the depth of soil they need. Other trees will be planted on the Boulevard's sidewalk and on 126<sup>th</sup> Street

*Activities:*

New elements provided are electronic information kiosks at major access points; an LCD display on the garage extension on the east side of the Plaza; glass enclosed breezeways to house artwork.

*Electronic components:*

The Plaza will be wireless accessible. The eastern breezeway will be dedicated to electronic information and art. There will be LCD screens along the garage-side wall and the new lobby façade. The information kiosks will also be electronic.

*Stage:*

No fixed stage provided. Instead, a slightly elevated element can act as informal stage. The elevated element is low enough to allow a more formal stage to be temporarily built over it, if necessary.

## Appendix B: Survey Instruments

### A.

#### Opinion Survey of the Adam Clayton Powell Jr. State Office Building Tenants

#### QUESTIONNAIRE

---

Date: \_\_\_\_\_ Interviewee is:  
Time: \_\_\_\_\_ Male / Female; Young Adult / Middle-Aged / Senior

---

1. What is your zip code? \_\_\_\_\_

2. For how many years have you:

lived in this area? \_\_\_\_\_

visited this area? \_\_\_\_\_

worked in this area? \_\_\_\_\_

3. State Office Building Agency Information:

Which agency or office do you work for? \_\_\_\_\_

How many people work in your office? \_\_\_\_\_

On an average, how many visitors come to your office everyday? \_\_\_\_\_

What is the size of the population that you cater to? \_\_\_\_\_

Which parts of the city or the metropolitan area are served by your office?  
\_\_\_\_\_

Which area do most visitors to your office come from?  
\_\_\_\_\_

4. **How often do you visit the Plaza?**

- regularly (more than once a week)
- frequently (once a week on average)
- occasionally (twice a month or less)

5. **Which of the following reasons bring you to the Plaza?**

*(Check all applicable options)*

- passing through to the State Office Building activities at the Plaza (ex. Health Fair, Farmers Market, concerts etc.)
- outdoor relaxation
- other (describe) \_\_\_\_\_

6. **What means of transportation do you use to and from the Plaza?**

*(Check all applicable options)*

- walk
- bus
- subway
- drive
- other (describe) \_\_\_\_\_

7. **How would you rate the quality of the Plaza today?**

- very good
- good
- fair
- poor
- very bad

8. **What would you like to see changed in the Plaza?**

*(Check all applicable options)*

- physical layout
- landscaping (plants, trees, paving etc.)
- seating
- lighting
- activities
- other (describe) \_\_\_\_\_

9. **What would you like to see retained in the Plaza?**

*(Check all applicable options)*

- physical layout
- landscaping (plants, trees, paving etc.)
- seating
- lighting
- activities
- other (describe) \_\_\_\_\_

10. **What would you like to see added to the Plaza?**

*(Check all applicable options)*

- landscaping (plants, trees, paving etc.)
- seating
- lighting
- activities
- other (describe) \_\_\_\_\_

11. **What form of artistic/cultural expression would you like to see on the Plaza?**

*(Check all applicable options)*

- sculpture
- words

_____	food	
_____	music	
_____	dance	
_____	theater/film	
_____	other (describe)	_____

**B.**

**Opinion Survey of the Adam Clayton Powell Jr. State Office Building Plaza Users  
QUESTIONNAIRE**

---

**Date:** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Time:** \_\_\_\_\_

**Interviewee is:**  
Male / Female;      Young Adult / Middle-Aged / Senior

---

1.      **What is your zip code?**      \_\_\_\_\_

2.      **For how many years have you:**  
         lived in this area?      \_\_\_\_\_  
         visited this area?      \_\_\_\_\_

3.      **What brings you to the Plaza today?**  
\_\_\_\_\_  
         passing through to the State Office Building  
\_\_\_\_\_  
         passing through to another destination  
         activities at the Plaza (ex. Health Fair, Farmers Market, concerts  
         etc.)  
\_\_\_\_\_  
         outdoor relaxation  
\_\_\_\_\_  
         waiting for a bus  
\_\_\_\_\_  
         visiting Harlem  
\_\_\_\_\_  
         other (describe)      \_\_\_\_\_

4.      **What means of transportation did you use to reach the Plaza?**  
\_\_\_\_\_  
         walk  
\_\_\_\_\_  
         bus  
\_\_\_\_\_  
         subway

\_\_\_\_\_ drive  
\_\_\_\_\_ other (describe) \_\_\_\_\_

5. **How often do you visit the Plaza?**

\_\_\_\_\_ regularly (more than once a week)  
\_\_\_\_\_ frequently (once a week on average)  
\_\_\_\_\_ occasionally (twice a month or less)

**Ask Q. 6A & 6B ONLY if answer to Q. 5 is "regularly" or "frequently":**

6A. **Which of the following reasons bring you to the Plaza?**  
*(Check all applicable options)*

\_\_\_\_\_ passing through to the State Office Building  
\_\_\_\_\_ activities at the Plaza (ex. Health Fair, Farmers Market, concerts)  
\_\_\_\_\_ outdoor relaxation  
\_\_\_\_\_ other (describe) \_\_\_\_\_

6B. **What other means of transportation do you use to and from the Plaza?**  
*(Check all applicable options)*

\_\_\_\_\_ walk  
\_\_\_\_\_ bus  
\_\_\_\_\_ subway  
\_\_\_\_\_ drive  
\_\_\_\_\_ other (describe) \_\_\_\_\_

7. **How would you rate the quality of the Plaza today?**

\_\_\_\_\_ very good  
\_\_\_\_\_ good  
\_\_\_\_\_ fair

\_\_\_\_\_ poor  
\_\_\_\_\_ very bad

8. **What would you like to see changed in the Plaza?**

*(Check all applicable options)*

\_\_\_\_\_ physical layout  
\_\_\_\_\_ landscaping (plants, trees, paving etc.)  
\_\_\_\_\_ seating  
\_\_\_\_\_ lighting  
\_\_\_\_\_ activities  
\_\_\_\_\_ other (describe) \_\_\_\_\_

9. **What would you like to see retained in the Plaza?**

*(Check all applicable options)*

\_\_\_\_\_ physical layout  
\_\_\_\_\_ landscaping (plants, trees, paving etc.)  
\_\_\_\_\_ seating  
\_\_\_\_\_ lighting  
\_\_\_\_\_ activities  
\_\_\_\_\_ other (describe) \_\_\_\_\_

10. **What would you like to see added to the Plaza?**

*(Check all applicable options)*

\_\_\_\_\_ landscaping (plants, trees, paving etc.)  
\_\_\_\_\_ seating  
\_\_\_\_\_ lighting  
\_\_\_\_\_ activities  
\_\_\_\_\_ visitor center  
\_\_\_\_\_ water feature

\_\_\_\_\_ other (describe) \_\_\_\_\_

11. **What type of artistic or cultural representation would you like to see on the Plaza?**

*(Check all applicable options)*

- \_\_\_\_\_ sculpture
- \_\_\_\_\_ words
- \_\_\_\_\_ food
- \_\_\_\_\_ music
- \_\_\_\_\_ dance
- \_\_\_\_\_ theater/film
- \_\_\_\_\_ other (describe) \_\_\_\_\_